

BUILT HERITAGE SUB-COMMITTEE

APPLICATION FOR DEMOLITION AND NEW CONSTRUCTION AT 270 BUCHAN ROAD, A PROPERTY DESIGNATED UNDER PART V OF THE *ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT* AND LOCATED IN THE ROCKCLIFFE PARK HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

ACS2017-PIE-RHU-0004

RIDEAU-ROCKCLIFFE (13)

REPORT RECOMMENDATION

That Planning Committee recommend that Council:

1. Refuse the application to demolish 270 Buchan Road, a property located in the Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District, designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*; and
2. Refuse the application to construct a new building on the property located at 270 Buchan Road, located in the Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District, designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

(Note: The statutory 90-day timeline for consideration of this application under the *Ontario Heritage Act* will expire on May 25, 2017.)

This matter was considered by the Built Heritage Sub-Committee (BHSC) at its meeting of 13 April 2017, and was CARRIED as presented. The Sub-committee heard delegations and received written correspondence on this matter, as noted in their Minutes.

Planning Committee heard ten delegations on this matter.

- Susan d'Aquino, Rockcliffe Park Heritage Committee*, supported the staff recommendation to refuse this application. She argued there is no justification, in applying the 2016 Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District (HCD) Plan, to demolish a significant Grade 1 building in the HCD if it can be retained, that demolition would violate the protections afforded in the previous HCD Plan, and that the proposed dwelling would not be consistent/compatible with important prescriptive provisions of the Rockcliffe Park HCD Plan in terms of footprint and mass/scale.
- Marianne Feaver, Rockcliffe Park Heritage Committee*, supported the staff recommendation to refuse the application, suggesting the existing house cannot be demolished as it is significant to the heritage district.
- Michael Kelen, Rockcliffe Park Heritage Committee, supported the staff recommendation to refuse the application, stating that the proposed dwelling will be compatible with the proposed Rockcliffe Park HCDP due to its significant increase in footprint and loss of greenspace.
- Nick Dawes spoke supported the staff recommendation to refuse this application. He objected to the size of the proposed dwelling, noting that if extra living space is required by the family, the existing house could be renovated and/or added onto.
- David Jeanes, President, Heritage Ottawa, spoke in support of the staff recommendation to refuse the applications, declaring that there is no justification for the demolition of a contributing, grade 1 structure in the Rockcliffe Park HCD.

The following individuals spoke for the applicant/owner, in opposition to the staff recommendation:

- Mr. Rod Lahey, Roderick Lahey Architect Inc., provided an overview of the proposal and responded to questions
- Lori Anglin, Cultural Heritage Specialist, spoke to the Cultural Heritage Impact Statement for this property, which she had prepared.
- Alan Cohen, Soloway Wright LLP noted that the 2016 Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District Plan (HCDP) is under appeal and not yet in effect and

that this proposal should be assessed on the 1997 HCDP.

- John Szczepaniak, Landscape Architect, elaborate on the proposed landscaping for the development.
- Brian Casagrande, FOTENN Consultants argued that this proposal should be assessed on the 1997 HCDP and that it meets the grounds for demolition

[Individuals / groups marked with an asterisk above provided written comments; all submissions are held on file with the City Clerk.]*

The following staff responded to questions: Ms. Sally Coutts, Coordinator, Right-of-Way, Heritage & Urban Design Services, Planning, Infrastructure and Economic Development department, and Mr. Tim Marc, Senior Legal Counsel, Planning, Development and Real Estate, Office of the City Clerk and Solicitor.

Item 3 of Planning Committee Agenda 43, as set out below, was put to Committee.

That Planning Committee recommend that Council:

- 1. Refuse the application to demolish 270 Buchan Road, a property located in the Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District, designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and**
- 2. Refuse the application to construct a new building on the property located at 270 Buchan Road, located in the Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District, designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.**

(Note: The statutory 90-day timeline for consideration of this application under the *Ontario Heritage Act* will expire on May 25, 2017.)

LOST, on a tie vote, on a division of 5 yeas and 5 nays, as follows:

YEAS (5): Councillors J. Cloutier, J. Leiper, T. Nussbaum, S. Qadri and Chair J. Harder

NAYS (5): Councillors S. Blais, R. Brockington, R. Chiarelli, A. Hubley and Vice-chair J. Harder

Motion N°. PLC 43/1

Moved by Councillor T. Tierney

That Planning Committee:

1. **recommend Council approve the application to demolish 270 Buchan Road, a property located in the Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District, designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*;**
2. **direct that this report rise to Council at its meeting of May 24, 2017; and**
3. **direct that Right of Way, Heritage and Urban Design Services staff work with the applicant to determine if any revisions should be made to the application for new construction, including which portions of the existing house can be preserved as part of any redevelopment.**

CARRIED, on a division of 5 yeas and 4 nays, as follows:

YEAS (5): Councillors S. Blais, R. Brockington, A. Hubley, Vice-chair
T. Tierney and Chair J. Harder

NAYS (4): Councillors J. Cloutier, J. Leiper, T. Nussbaum and S. Qadri

Item 3 of Planning Committee Agenda 43 was CARRIED as amended by Motion N°. PLC 43/1.

Note: During the course of discussion on this item, Richcraft Homes, the property owner, provided a written agreement to extend the statutory 90-day timeline for consideration of this application to 30 June 2017.